

[Final manuscript. Forthcoming: *Oxford University Press*]

WORKING FROM WITHIN

The Nature and Development of Quine's Naturalism

Table of Contents

Preface	ix
List of Abbreviations	xiii
1. Introduction	1
PART I: NATURE	
2. Naturalizing Epistemology	23
3. Naturalizing Metaphysics	63
4. In Mediis Rebus	93
PART II: DEVELOPMENT	
5. Sign and Object	129
6. Analytic and Synthetic	169
7. Science and Philosophy	227
8. Conclusion	259
Appendices	265
Bibliography	309
Index	351

Extended Table of Contents

Preface	ix
List of Abbreviations	xiii
1. Introduction	1
1.0. Summary	1
1.1. Historical background	2
1.2. Naturalism and analytic philosophy	7
1.3. Working from within	10
1.4. Reading Quine in historical context	12
1.5. Plan	16
PART I: NATURE	
2. Naturalizing Epistemology	23
2.0. Summary	23
2.1. Introduction	23
2.2. From certainty to straight psychology	29
2.3. Two strategies	39
2.4. Self-sufficient sensory languages	41
2.5. Quine's response to the sceptic	47
2.6. Taking holism seriously	50

2.7. Theory vs. evidence	53
2.8. Reinterpreting “Epistemology Naturalized”	57
3. Naturalizing Metaphysics	63
3.0. Summary	63
3.1. Introduction	64
3.2. Internal and external existence claims	68
3.3. Two distinctions	74
3.4. Quine on metaphysical existence claims	80
3.5. Scientific sense and metaphysical nonsense	86
3.6. Conclusion	91
4. In Mediis Rebus	93
4.0. Summary	93
4.1. Introduction	93
4.2. Three commitments	96
4.3. A quirk of usage	105
4.4. Deflation, deflation, deflation	112
4.5. The bounds of science	116
4.6. Immanence and transcendence	119
4.7. Artificial languages	124
4.8. Conclusion	126

PART II: DEVELOPMENT

5. Sign and Object	129
5.0. Summary	129
5.1. Introduction	129
5.2. Philosophical background	133
5.3. Starting at the middle	137
5.4. The nature of metaphysical judgments	139
5.5. A pragmatic interpretation of positivism	144
5.6. The philosopher's task	148
5.7. Two problems	153
5.8. "Two Dogmas"	158
5.9. Language and knowledge	163
5.10. Conclusion	166
6. Analytic and Synthetic	169
6.0. Summary	169
6.1. Introduction	169
6.2. Narrow and wide holism	173
6.3. Mathematical objects and mathematical knowledge	181
6.4. The principle of tolerance	185
6.5. A behavioristically acceptable definition	188
6.6. Triangular correspondence	195
6.7. Quine on asemiotism	198
6.8. "The whole of science"	205
6.9. Maximal integration	209

6.10. Universal revisability	213
6.11. Maximal inclusion	219
6.12. Conclusion	225
7. Science and Philosophy	227
7.0. Summary	227
7.1. Introduction	227
7.2. Ordinary language and the language of science	230
7.3. Philosophy and science; science and philosophy	238
7.4. The reception of Quine's naturalism	244
7.5. Adopting an 'ism'	249
7.6. Conclusion	257
8. Conclusion	259
Appendices	
A1. Editorial Introduction	267
A2. A Pragmatic Interpretation of Positivism (1937)	271
A3. Logic, Mathematics, Science (1940)	273
A4. Sign and Object; or, The Semantics of Being (1944)	282
A5. A Letter to Nelson Goodman (1949)	290
A6. The Present State of Empiricism (1951)	295
A7. The Sophisticated Irrational (1965)	309
Bibliography	311
Index	351

Preface

This book is the result of almost nine years of thinking and writing about Quine's naturalism. The project started with a term paper on the Carnap-Quine debate for Jeanne Peijnenburg's inspiring course on the history of analytic philosophy in 2008 and gradually evolved into a dissertation about the relation between holism and naturalism in Quine's philosophy, which I defended in Groningen in 2015. Encouraged by the warm support of my colleagues and a number of fellow Quine scholars, I spent the last two years revising and extending the manuscript. Having acquired a serious case of 'archive fever', a significant chunk of this period was spent at the W. V. Quine Papers at Houghton Library, Harvard University. Using his published corpus as well the thousands of letters, notes, draft manuscripts, lectures, grant proposals, teaching materials, and annotations collected at the archives, I have aimed to write a book that reconstructs both the nature and the development of Quine's naturalism. The notes, letters, and lectures that have most influenced my views about (the development of) Quine's naturalism are transcribed and collected in the appendix.

Parts of this book have been published elsewhere:

Quine's Argument from Despair (2014). *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 22(1):150-173. (chapter 2)

Blurring Boundaries: Carnap, Quine, and the Internal-External Distinction

(2017). *Erkenntnis*, 82(4):873-890. (chapter 3)

Boarding Neurath's Boat: The Early Development of Quine's Naturalism

(2017). *Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 55(2):317-342. (sections 4.1-4.2, 6.2, and 6.6)

Quine on the Nature of Naturalism (2017). *The Southern Journal of*

Philosophy, 55(1):96-115. (section 4.5)

Sign and Object: Quine's Forgotten Philosophical Book Project (forthcoming).

Synthese. (chapter 5)

Quine's 'Needlessly Strong' Holism (2017). *Studies in History and*

Philosophy of Science, Part A, 61(1):11-20. (sections 6.8-6.11)

Setting Sail: The Development and Reception of Quine's Naturalism

(forthcoming). *Philosophers' Imprint*. (chapter 7)

Still, this book aims to be more than a collection of papers. Many sections have been revised, extended and rewritten for the purposes of this book. Moreover, an introductory chapter, a conclusion, several new sections (i.e. 4.3-4.4; 4.6-4.8; 5.5; 6.3-6.5; 6.7), and seven appendices have been included to fill the gaps and to present a comprehensive account of Quine's naturalism.

Much of this research has been funded by The Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (grants 322-20-001 and 275-20-064). My research visits to Harvard University and Houghton Library have been funded by a Kristeller-Popkin Travel Fellowship from the *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, a Rodney G. Dennis

Fellowship in the Study of Manuscripts from Houghton Library, and a Travel Bursary from the Evert Willem Beth Foundation. I am very grateful for this financial support.

Finally, it is my great pleasure to thank the many people without whom I could not have completed this book: Jeanne Peijnenburg, Allard Tamminga, Lieven Decock, Gary Ebbs, Hans-Johann Glock, Gary Kemp, and two anonymous referees for Oxford University Press for their comments on earlier versions of this book; Harvard's Department of Philosophy, Nyasha Borde, Monique Duhaime, Juliet Floyd, Warren Goldfarb, Leslie Morris, Mark Richard, and the staff at Houghton Library and the Harvard University Archives for their warm welcome during my research visits; Jody Azzouni, Richard Creath, Fons Dewulf, Juliet Floyd, Warren Goldfarb, Peter Hylton, Thomas Ricketts, Andrew Smith, Serdal Tumkaya, Thomas Uebel, Wim Vanrie, the members of the EPS seminar in Tilburg, the members of the PCCP and the WiP seminars in Groningen, and audiences in Amsterdam, Athens, Bologna, Calgary, Denver, Edinburgh, Groningen, Konstanz, Manchester, Milan, Modena, Munich, Rotterdam, Tampa, Tilburg, and Zürich for their comments on various papers and chapters in various stages; Reto Gubelmann, Frederique Janssen-Lauret, Gary Kemp, and Sean Morris for their wonderful Quine workshops in Denver, Glasgow, Manchester and Zürich; and Douglas Quine and Catherine Elgin for granting me permission to publish some of Quine's and Goodman's notes and letters as appendices to this book. Of course, the above individuals do not necessarily agree with all my conclusions and they are not responsible for any residual errors or omissions.

A note on citation and transcription: Unless specified differently, the unpublished documents I refer to in this book are part of the W. V. Quine Papers, collection MS Am 2587, Houghton Library, Harvard University. In the main text and

in the footnotes, I refer to these documents by citing dates (if known) and item numbers. A letter of Quine to the American Philosophical Association, for example, could be referred to as (January 1, 1950, item 31). For quick reference, the item numbers are listed in the List of Abbreviations (pp. xiii-xxii). The items' full titles and box numbers are provided in the bibliography. In transcribing Quine's autograph notes, drafts, and letters, I have aimed to minimize editorial interference and chosen not to correct ungrammatical shorthand. In referring to Quine's *published* work, I use abbreviations (listed in the List of Abbreviations) as well as the year in which the paper or book was first published. If the paper is incorporated in one of Quine's collections of papers, the page numbers will refer to this collection. The first page of "Two Dogmas of Empiricism", for example, will be referred to as (TDE, 1951a, 20). The details of Quine's published work cited in this book are provided in the bibliography.

In his autobiography, *The Time of My Life*, Quine argues that science and history of science appeal to very different tempers: "An advance in science resolves an obscurity, a tangle, a complexity, an inelegance, that the scientist then gratefully dismisses and forgets. The historian of science tries to recapture the very tangles, confusions, and obscurities from which the scientist is so eager to free himself" (TML, 1985a, 194). I hope this book accomplishes a bit of both; although I will show that Quine faced many tangles, confusions, and obscurities in developing his naturalism, I also hope to convey that the system he created is one of great clarity and elegance.

Sander Verhaegh

Amsterdam, December 2017

List of Abbreviations

This section provides a list of abbreviations used in this book to refer to W. V. Quine's published and unpublished work. Detailed references can be found in the Bibliography. A complete list of Quine's publications up to approximately 1997 (including reprints and translations) can be found in Yeghiayan (2009). For an overview of papers, books, reprints, and translations after 1997, see Douglas B. Quine's website <http://www.wvquine.org>. Quine's unpublished papers, letters, lectures, and notebooks can be accessed at Houghton Library, Harvard University. The documents' call numbers, box numbers, and item numbers are provided in the Bibliography. A finding aid for much of Quine's unpublished work can be found at <http://oasis.lib.harvard.edu/oasis/deliver/~hou01800>.

Archival sources

- Item 31 Correspondence with the American Philosophical Association (1936-1986)
- Item 86 Correspondence with Lars Bergström (1988-1996)
- Item 96 Correspondence with Evert Willem Beth (1947-1964)
- Item 205 Correspondence with the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences (1955-1979)
- Item 224 Correspondence with Alonzo Church (1935-1994)

- Item 231 Correspondence with Joseph T. Clark (1951-1953)
- Item 234 Correspondence Co- (various dates)
- Item 248 Correspondence with Columbia University (1949-1970)
- Item 254 Correspondence with James Bryant Conant (1951-1979)
- Item 260 Correspondence with John Cooley (1932-1962)
- Item 270 Correspondence with Richard Creath (1977-1998)
- Item 287 Correspondence with Donald Davidson (1957-1997)
- Item 306 Correspondence Di- through Do- (various dates)
- Item 315 Correspondence with Burton Dreben (1948-1997)
- Item 336 Correspondence Er- through Ez- (various dates)
- Item 370 Correspondence with Philipp Frank (1951-1967)
- Item 420 Correspondence with Nelson Goodman (1935-1994)
- Item 471 Correspondence with Harvard University, Department of Philosophy
(1930-1994)
- Item 473 Correspondence with Harvard University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences
(1931-1998)
- Item 475 Correspondence with Harvard University, Grants (1931-1988)
- Item 479 Correspondence with Harvard University, President's Office (1937-
1998)
- Item 529 Correspondence with Christopher Hookway (1988)
- Item 530 Correspondence with Paul Horwich (1991-1992)
- Item 531 Correspondence with Don Howard (1986-1991)
- Item 545 Correspondence with the Institute for Advanced Study (1955-1965)
- Item 553 Correspondence Ir- through Iz- (various dates)
- Item 570 Correspondence with the Journal of Symbolic Logic (1936-1996)

- Item 616 Correspondence with Imre Lakatos (1964-1974)
- Item 637 Correspondence with Michelle Leonelli (1966-1998)
- Item 643 Correspondence with Clarence Irving Lewis (1929-1996)
- Item 675 Correspondence with Joseph Margolis (1967 and undated)
- Item 724 Correspondence with Hugh Miller (1948-1952)
- Item 741 Correspondence with Charles W. Morris (1936-1947)
- Item 755 Correspondence with John Myhill (1943-1985)
- Item 758 Correspondence with Ernest Nagel (1938-1964)
- Item 921 Correspondence with the Rockefeller Foundation (1945-1980)
- Item 958 Correspondence Sc- (various dates)
- Item 972 Correspondence with Wilfred Sellars (1938-1980)
- Item 1001 Correspondence with B. F. Skinner (1934-1998)
- Item 1005 Correspondence with J. J. C. Smart (1949-1998)
- Item 1014 Correspondence with Ernest Sosa (1970-1995)
- Item 1200 Correspondence with Paul Weiss (1937-1972)
- Item 1213 Correspondence with Morton White (1939-1998)
- Item 1221 Correspondence with Donald Cary Williams (1940-1994)
- Item 1237 Correspondence with Joseph Henry Woodger (1938-1982)
- Item 1239 Correspondence with the World Congress of Philosophy (1952-1998)
- Item 1244 Correspondence with Morton G. Wurtele (1938-1997)
- Item 1263 Correspondence concerning requests to publish or for copies (1950-1959)
- Item 1355 Editorial correspondence with D. Reidel Publishing Company (1960-1982 and undated)

- Item 1422 Editorial correspondence concerning *Ontological Relativity* (1968-1988)
- Item 1423 Editorial correspondence concerning *On Translation* (1956-1959)
- Item 1443 Editorial correspondence concerning *On What There Is* (1948-1975)
- Item 1488 Editorial correspondence concerning *Word and Object* (1952-1960)
- Item 1489 Editorial correspondence concerning *Word and Object* (1959-1980 and undated)
- Item 1490 Editorial correspondence concerning *Words and Objections* (1966-1974)
- Item 2388a Quine's Annotated Copy of Putnam's *Meaning and the Moral Sciences* (undated)
- Item 2441 *Epistemology Naturalized; or, the Case for Psychologism* (1968)
- Item 2498 *In conversation: Professor W. V. Quine. Interviews by Rudolf Fara* (1993)
- Item 2733 *Russell's Ontological Development* (1966-1967)
- Item 2756 *Stimulus and Meaning* (1965)
- Item 2836 Foreword to the Third Edition of *From a Logical Point of View* (1979)
- Item 2884 *Questions for Quine* by Stephen Neale (1986)
- Item 2902 For Rockefeller Lecture (1968)
- Item 2903 For Symposium with Sellars (1968)
- Item 2928 The Inception of "New Foundations" (1987)
- Item 2948 *Kinds* (1967)
- Item 2952 Levine Seminar Questions for Quine (1982)
- Item 2954 *Logic, Math, Science* (1940)
- Item 2958 *Mathematical Entities* (1950)

- Item 2969 Nominalism (1937)
- Item 2971 The Notre Dame Lectures (1970)
- Item 2994 Ontological Relativity (1967)
- Item 2995 Ontological Relativity (1968)
- Item 3011 The Place of a Theory of Evidence (1952)
- Item 3015 The Present State of Empiricism (1951)
- Item 3102 Word and Object Seminar (1967)
- Item 3158 Philosophy 148 (1953)
- Item 3169 Early Jottings on Philosophy of Language (1937-1944)
- Item 3170 Erledigte Notized (various dates)
- Item 3181 Ontology, Metaphysics, etc... (1944-1951)
- Item 3182 Philosophical Notes (various dates)
- Item 3184 Pragmatism, etc... (1951-1953)
- Item 3225 Miscellaneous Papers (1925-1931)
- Item 3236 Papers in Philosophy (1930-1931)
- Item 3266 Philosophy 148 (ca. 1947)
- Item 3277 Oxford University Lectures (1953-1954)
- Item 3283 Oxford University Lecture: Philosophy of Logic (1953-1954)

Published work

- ANM Animadversion on the Notion of Meaning (1949)
- AWVQ Autobiography of W.V. Quine (1986)
- CA Carnap (1987)

CB	Comment on Berger (1990)
CCE	Confessions of a Confirmed Extensionalist and Other Essays (2008)
CD	Contextual Definition (1995)
CGC	A Comment on Grünbaum's Claim (1962)
CLT	Carnap and Logical Truth (1954)
CPT	Carnap's Positivist Travail (1984)
CNT	Comments on Neil Tennant's "Carnap and Quine" (1994)
CVO	Carnap's Views on Ontology (1951)
DE	Designation and Existence (1939)
EBDQ	Exchange Between Donald Davidson and W. V. Quine Following Davidson's Lecture (1994)
EESW	On Empirically Equivalent Systems of the World (1975)
EN	Epistemology Naturalized (1969)
EQ	Existence and Quantification (1968)
FHQP	Four Hot Questions in Philosophy (1985)
FLPV	<i>From a Logical Point of View</i> (1953/1961)
FM	Facts of the Matter (1977)
FME	Five Milestones of Empiricism (1975)
FSS	<i>From Stimulus to Science</i> (1995)
GQW	Nelson Goodman, W. V. Quine and Morton White: A Triangular Correspondence (1947)
GT	Grades of Theoreticity (1970)
IOH	Identity, Ostension, Hypostasis (1946)
IPOS	In Praise of Observation Sentences (1993)
IQ	The Ideas of Quine. Interview by B. Magee (1978)

ITA	Indeterminacy of Translation Again (1987)
IV	Immanence and Validity (1991)
IWVQ	Interview with Willard Van Orman Quine. Interview by L. Bergström and D. Føllesdal (1994)
LAOP	A Logistical Approach to the Ontological Problem (1939)
LC	Lectures on Carnap (1934)
LDHP	Lectures on David Hume's Philosophy (1946)
LP	Linguistics and Philosophy (1968)
ML1	<i>Methods of Logic</i> . First edition (1950)
ML4	<i>Methods of Logic</i> . Fourth edition (1982)
MSLT	Mr. Strawson on Logical Theory (1953)
NEN	Notes on Existence and Necessity (1943)
NK	Natural Kinds (1969)
NLOM	Naturalism; Or, Living within One's Means (1995)
NNK	The Nature of Natural Knowledge (1975)
NO	Nominalism (1946)
OI	Ontology and Ideology (1951)
OME	On Mental Entities (1953)
ONAS	On the Notion of an Analytic Statement (1946)
OR	Ontological Relativity (1968)
ORE	<i>Ontological Relativity and other essays</i> (1969)
ORPC	Ontological Remarks on the Propositional Calculus (1934)
ORWN	Ontological Reduction and the World of Numbers (1964)
OW	Otherworldly (1978)
OWTI	On What There Is (1948)

PL	<i>Philosophy of Logic</i> (1970/1986)
PPE	The Pragmatists' Place in Empiricism (1975)
PPLT	Philosophical Progress in Language Theory (1970)
PR	Posits and Reality (1955)
PT	<i>Pursuit of Truth</i> (1990/1992)
PTF	Progress on Two Fronts (1996)
QCC	The Quine-Carnap Correspondence (1932-1970)
QD	<i>Quine in Dialogue</i> (2008)
QSM	Quine Speaks His Mind. An interview by E. Pivcevic (1988)
QU	<i>Quiddities</i> (1987)
QWVO	Quine/'kwain/, Willard Van Orman (b. 1908) (1996)
RA	Responses to Articles by Abel Bergström, Davidson, Dreben, Gibson, Hookway, and Prawitz (1994)
RC	Reply to Chomsky (1968)
RCP	Reply to Charles Parsons (1986)
RE	Reactions (1995)
RES	Responses to Szubka, Lehrer, Bergström, Gibson, Miscevic, and Orenstein (1999)
RGE	Response to Gary Ebbs (1995)
RGH	Reply to Geoffrey Hellman (1986)
RGM	Responding to Grover Maxwell (1968)
RHP	Reply to Hilary Putnam (1986)
RJV	Reply to Jules Vuillemin (1986)
RMW	Reply to Morton White (1986)
ROD	Russell's Ontological Development (1966)

RR	<i>The Roots of Reference</i> (1973)
RRN	Reply to Robert Nozick (1986)
RS1	Reply to Stroud (1968)
RS2	Reply to Stroud (1981)
RSM	Reply to Smart (1968)
RST	Reply to Stenius (1968)
RTD	Reply to Davidson (1968)
RTE	Responses to Essays by Smart, Orenstein, Lewis and Holdcroft, and Haack (1997)
SCN	Steps toward a Constructive Nominalism (1947)
SLP	<i>Selected Logic Papers</i> (1966/1995)
SLS	The Scope and Language of Science (1954)
SM	Stimulus and Meaning (1965)
SN	Structure and Nature (1992)
SSS	The Sensory Support of Science (1986)
STL	<i>Set Theory and its Logic</i> (1963/1969)
TC	Truth by Convention (1936)
TDE	Two Dogmas of Empiricism (1951)
TDR	Two Dogmas in Retrospect (1991)
TI	Three Indeterminacies (1990)
TML	<i>The Time of My Life</i> (1985)
TR	Truth (1994)
TT	<i>Theories and Things</i> (1981)
TTPT	Things and Their Place in Theories (1981)
VD	Vagaries of Definition (1972)

VITD	On the Very Idea of a Third Dogma (1981)
WDWD	Where Do We Disagree (1999)
WB	<i>The Web of Belief</i> (with J. S. Ullian 1970/1978)
WIB	What I Believe (1984)
WO	<i>Word and Object</i> (1960)
WP	<i>The Ways of Paradox and other essays</i> (1966/1976)
WPB	What Price Bivalence? (1981)
WRML	Whitehead and the Rise of Modern Logic (1941)
WW	The Way the World Is (1986)